

BEFORE THE  
PENNSYLVANIA GAME COMMISSION

\* \* \* \* \*

BEFORE: RONALD A. WEANER, President  
Ralph A. Martone, Vice President  
David J. Putnam, Secretary  
Gregory J. Isabella, Commissioner  
Thomas E. Boop, Commissioner  
David w. Schreffler, Commissioner  
James J. Delaney, Commissioner  
Robert W. Schlemmer, Commissioner

HEARING: Tuesday, January 24, 2012  
8:30 a.m.

LOCATION: Pennsylvania Game Commission  
2001 Elmerton Avenue  
Harrisburg, PA 17110

Reporter: Jolynn C. Prunoske

Any reproduction of this transcript  
is prohibited without authorization  
by the certifying agency.

A P P E A R A N C E S

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MARK TERNENT

CAL DUBROCK, Director of Wildlife Management

RICHARD PALMER, Director of Wildlife Protection

BILL CAPOUILLEZ, Director of Wildlife Habitat  
Management

I N D E X

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

DISCUSSION AMONG PARTIES

5 - 101

E X H I B I T S

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Number

Description

Page  
Offered

NONE OFFERED

## P R O C E E D I N G S

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

-----  
MR. WEANER:

The meeting will now come to order.  
We're holding a public meeting of the Board of  
Commissioners of the Pennsylvania Game Commission. I  
would like you to all stand and join me with a salute  
for our flag.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE RECITED

MR. WEANER:

Again, I would like to remind everyone to  
turn off or disable your cell phones. And in a  
housekeeping matter, I was forced to get a new e-mail  
address because we got finally high speed internet.  
Down here on the stage is a couple of business cards,  
especially for members of the press, or anyone at all,  
it has my new e-mail address on it. At this time, Mr.  
Secretary, will you take the role?

MR. PUTNAM:

Commissioner Boop.

MR. BOOP:

Present.

MR. PUTNAM:

Commissioner Schreffler.

MR. SCHREFFLER:

1 Present.

2 MR. PUTNAM:

3 Commissioner Putnam. Present.

4 Commissioner Weaner.

5 MR. WEANER:

6 Present.

7 MR. PUTNAM:

8 Commissioner Martone.

9 MR. MARTONE:

10 Present.

11 MR. PUTNAM:

12 Commissioner Delaney.

13 MR. DELANEY:

14 Present.

15 MR. PUTNAM:

16 Commissioner Schlemmer.

17 MR. SCHLEMMER:

18 Present.

19 MR. PUTNAM:

20 Commissioner Isabella.

21 MR. ISABELLA:

22 Present.

23 MR. PUTNAM:

24 Mr. President, all Commissioners are

25 present.

1                   MR. WEANER:

2                   Thank you very much. And this will also  
3 be the last time that this group is all present.  
4 Okay. I'll turn it over for just a minute or two  
5 here.

6                   MR. ROE:

7                   I just want to take this opportunity to  
8 get it on the record, the official record for all  
9 posterity that we're having two Regional Directors who  
10 this will be their last meeting with the Pennsylvania  
11 Game Commission. Regional Director Denny Dusza from  
12 the Northcentral Region and Regional Director Steve  
13 Schweitzer from the Northeast Region. They'll be  
14 retiring here. So I just wanted to take this  
15 opportunity to thank them for their combined almost 80  
16 years of service to the Pennsylvania Game Commission  
17 and to the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. And Denny  
18 and Steve, we're certainly going to miss you. And  
19 thank you for all the great things you've done for the  
20 wildlife resources of the Commonwealth. Thank you.

21                   MR. WEANER:

22                   Okay. Thanks very much. Since we've met  
23 last, we have the minutes from our October Board  
24 meeting and the December 20th meeting to approve. Is  
25 there a motion to approve these minutes?

1                   MR. DELANEY:

2                   So moved.

3                   MR. WEANER:

4                   Is there a second?

5                   MR. SCHLEMMER:

6                   Second.

7                   MR. WEANER:

8                   Moved by Commissioner Delaney, seconded  
9 by Commissioner Schlemmer. Is there any discussion?  
10 Hearing none, we shall proceed to vote. All those in  
11 favor, signify by saying aye.

12 AYES RESPOND

13                   MR. WEANER:

14                   Those opposed say no. Mr. Secretary?

15                   MR. PUTNAM:

16                   Mr. President, the minutes are approved.

17                   MR. WEANER:

18                   The motion passes. Thank you very much.  
19 We will just continue through the agenda as it's  
20 written before you. We'll move on to page number two,  
21 Bureau of Wildlife Management.

22                   MR. BECHTEL:

23                   The first item to come before the  
24 Commission today is the Bureau of Wildlife Management.  
25 It concerns a proposed rule making amending 58 PA Code



1 is also proposed. The taking of black bear by  
2 properly licensed hunters during all deer seasons from  
3 September through mid-December in Wildlife Management  
4 Units 1A, 2B, 5B, 5C and 5D will be allowed.

5 Changes to beaver trapping regulations  
6 follow the recently implemented beaver management plan  
7 and changes are proposed for WMUs 3A, 3D and 5D. WMUs  
8 3A and 3D are proposed to reduce the season bag limit  
9 to 20 beavers in these WMUs. But the nuisance  
10 complaints in WMU 5D are currently the fourth highest  
11 in the state. It would help alleviate these  
12 complaints in WMU 5D as it's proposed to increase the  
13 beaver bag limit to 20.

14 The addition of WMU 4C in the 2012-2013  
15 bobcat hunting and trapping season has been proposed.  
16 This is based on expanding population numbers and a  
17 trend of increasing incidental captures of bobcats in  
18 WMU 4C.

19 In addition, two WMUs, 2G and 4D, are  
20 proposed for fisher harvesting. This is based on an  
21 expanding fisher population and increased numbers of  
22 incident captures in these WMUs.

23 MR. WEANER:

24 Okay. At this time, is anyone interested  
25 in making a motion which will adopt the bag limits as

1 explained on page 4 through 11?

2 MR. SCHLEMMER:

3 Mr. President, ---

4 MR. WEANER:

5 Yeah.

6 MR. SCHLEMMER:

7 --- I would like to make an amendment.

8 MR. WEANER:

9 First we have to get a motion on the  
10 floor. Would you like to make this motion?

11 MR. SCHLEMMER:

12 I'll make the motion.

13 MR. WEANER:

14 Is there a second?

15 MR. BOOP:

16 Second.

17 MR. WEANER:

18 Schlemmer moves, Mr. Boop seconds the  
19 motion to adopt raising the seasons and bag limits on  
20 pages 4 through 12. Now, during the discussion period  
21 here, what I've proposed to do is go through like a  
22 page or two at a time. If anyone wants to offer  
23 discussion or amendments on those pages, this will be  
24 the time. The amendment will be discussed. It will  
25 be voted on. If it passes, it becomes part of the

1 motion. If it fails, we move on. We will go through  
2 it in kind of a systematic way here.

3 MR. PUTNAM:

4 Mr. President, ---

5 MR. WEANER:

6 Yes, sir.

7 MR. PUTNAM:

8 --- if I may comment before we go past  
9 page three.

10 MR. WEANER:

11 Go ahead.

12 MR. PUTNAM:

13 For the record, I think it's important.  
14 We talked about the Pike Run Wild Pheasant Recovery  
15 Area last year at one of our meetings. Just briefly,  
16 I need to say that we did have a discussion with  
17 regards to Pike Run yesterday afternoon. In fact, an  
18 extensive discussion with Biologist Clinger in that  
19 regard. So, I'm hopeful that as we go through and we  
20 discuss the seasons and bag limits, the sporting  
21 public understands that we did have some pretty decent  
22 discussions and some commentaries from Commissioners  
23 yesterday with regard to Pike Run.

24 MR. WEANER:

25 Thank you. Okay. Let's a take a look at

1 pages four and five. And at this time, I will  
2 entertain any discussions relative to pages four or  
3 five.

4 MR. SCHREFFLER:

5 Mr. President, ---

6 MR. WEANER:

7 Go ahead.

8 MR. SCHREFFLER:

9 --- I wish to make an amendment changing  
10 the last day of certain seasons. The first one is  
11 under squirrel on page four, the second line. I would  
12 like to change the last day from December 22nd to  
13 December 24th. The next that I am proposing is for  
14 ruffed grouse. And on ruffed grouse, the second line,  
15 I would like to change the last day from December 22nd  
16 to December 24th. The third is rabbit, cottontail.  
17 And it would be the second line again. I would like  
18 to change the last day from December 22nd to December  
19 24th. And on page five, under ring-neck pheasant,  
20 male or female, the second line, I would like to  
21 change the last day from December 22nd to December  
22 24th.

23 MR. WEANER:

24 We have a motion to extend these small  
25 game seasons for squirrel, ruffed grouse, rabbit and

1 ring-neck pheasants. Slash out December 22nd and put  
2 in December 24th. Is there a second?

3 MR. DELANEY:

4 Second.

5 MR. WEANER:

6 Okay. Moved by Commissioner Schreffler,  
7 seconded by Commissioner Delaney. Is there any  
8 discussion on this motion? Go ahead.

9 MR. BOOP:

10 Mr. President, I, like everyone else who  
11 hunts, like increased opportunities. And I appreciate  
12 that children are available from school, college  
13 students are home and families are together, but I  
14 just don't think this is --- when we balance  
15 everything that's involved, I just don't think that  
16 extending one day is a good idea for the following  
17 reason. Currently, the season would end on a Saturday  
18 the 22nd. This would take it to Monday the 24th.  
19 Monday is Christmas Eve. Our WCOs and our PO people,  
20 we count on them to be out there from September  
21 through mid-December. And I just don't think it's  
22 fair that we ask our limited staff to have to work on  
23 Christmas Eve when they have an opportunity to be  
24 their family. Just imagine for a WCO what this is  
25 going to mean if he has an HRSI or a hunting accident

1 at noon on that Saturday. So, yes, I would like to  
2 see the increased opportunity, but I think, being  
3 sensitive to staff and having an opportunity to be  
4 with their families across the state, I just think  
5 outweighs the benefit of one additional day after we  
6 have hunting basically from September on. So, I will  
7 vote against the proposed amendment.

8 MR. WEANER:

9 Commissioner Martone.

10 MR. MARTONE:

11 I have the same concerns as Commissioner  
12 Boop, but I also would like to believe in consistency.  
13 This year, the 24th fell on a Saturday. It would have  
14 been an excellent day to add to that season. And we  
15 had it closed that day. And just for consistency, I'd  
16 like to just start a consistent pattern of ending on  
17 the 24th. So, I will be voting for it. And I would  
18 encourage my fellow commissioners to do the same.

19 MR. WEANER:

20 Further discussion?

21 MR. DELANEY:

22 Mr. President, ---

23 MR. WEANER:

24 Go ahead.

25 MR. DELANEY:

1           --- one point I would like to make, too.  
2 The sportsmen say that we don't listen to them enough.  
3 Many members of this Board heard from sportsmen across  
4 the state not being able to hunt this past Christmas  
5 Eve on a Saturday, many of them wanting to get their  
6 kids out. So, I'm supportive of this and concur with  
7 Commissioner Martone. We can't keep changing things  
8 every other year. So, I think we lost some  
9 opportunity this year and hopefully we can get it back  
10 next year.

11           MR. WEANER:

12           Further discussion? Hearing none, we  
13 shall vote. Again, the motion to extend squirrel,  
14 ruffed grouse, rabbit and ring-neck pheasant seasons  
15 from the 22nd, expand it one day to December 24th.  
16 All those in favor of this motion, signify by raising  
17 one hand.

18 AYES RESPOND

19           MR. WEANER:

20           Hands down. Those opposed, raise one  
21 hand, please.

22 NAYS RESPOND

23           MR. WEANER:

24           Hands down. Mr. Secretary?

25           MR. PUTNAM:

1                   Mr. President, the motion passes by a  
2 vote of seven to one.

3                   MR. WEANER:

4                   And Mr. Boop was the one no vote.  
5 Everyone else voted yes.

6                   MR. BOOP:

7                   I'm used to that, Mr. President.

8                   MR. WEANER:

9                   Thank you. Are there any other  
10 amendments or discussion on page four or five?

11                   MR. SCHLEMMER:

12                   Mr. President, ---

13                   MR. WEANER:

14                   Yes, sir. Go ahead.

15                   MR. SCHLEMMER:

16                   --- after discussions yesterday, I would  
17 like to move 2A, WMU 2A to male pheasants only for the  
18 upcoming season.

19                   MR. WEANER:

20                   This is on page five, right in the  
21 middle; right?

22                   MR. SCHLEMMER:

23                   Yes.

24                   MR. WEANER:

25                   Is there a second?

1                   MR. BOOP:

2                   Second.

3                   MR. WEANER:

4                   Moved by Commissioner Schlemmer, seconded  
5 by Commissioner Boop to move Wildlife Management 2A  
6 from the male or female season to the male-only season  
7 as seen on the middle of page five. Any discussion?

8                   MR. PUTNAM:

9                   Mr. President, that should cover the  
10 youth hunt as well as the normal --- the regular hunt.  
11 There's two places where it needs to be ---.

12                   MR. WEANER:

13                   Okay. That was your intent, Commissioner  
14 Schlemmer?

15                   MR. SCHLEMMER:

16                   Yes.

17                   MR. BOOP:

18                   I concur.

19                   MR. WEANER:

20                   Then that's the way the motion will read  
21 then. Thank you. Any other discussion? Hearing  
22 none, we shall vote on this. All those in favor of  
23 this change, signify by raising one hand.

24 AYES RESPOND

25                   MR. WEANER:

1 Hands down. All those opposed, raise one  
2 hand.

3 MR. PUTNAM:

4 Mr. President, the motion passes eight to  
5 nothing.

6 MR. WEANER:

7 Thank you very much. Any other questions  
8 or any other discussion or amendment to page four or  
9 five? Okay. Turn the page. Let's go to page six.  
10 Is there anything on page six that we wish to address?

11 MR. MARTONE:

12 Mr. President, ---

13 MR. WEANER:

14 Go ahead.

15 MR. MARTONE:

16 --- on page six, I would like to ---  
17 under turkey, male or female, I would like to  
18 eliminate the first category of WMUs 1A, 1B and 2A and  
19 add those down to the second --- third category down  
20 where it says WMUs 2C, 2D, 2E, 4A, 4B and 4D to  
21 include 1A, 1B and 2A.

22 MR. WEANER:

23 So the gist of your motion is that those  
24 areas, 1A, 1B and 2A, will allow rifles in fall turkey  
25 season?

1                   MR. MARTONE:

2                   Yes.

3                   MR. WEANER:

4                   Is there a second?

5                   MR. ISABELLA:

6                   Second.

7                   MR. WEANER:

8                   Seconded by Commissioner Isabella.

9 Discussion on this? Go ahead, Mr. Boop.

10                  MR. BOOP:

11                  And I guess maybe this is a personal  
12 observation, but I'm just not sure with this  
13 particular resource if we really need to be hunting  
14 turkeys in the fall with rifles. I mean, I haven't  
15 had an opportunity to vote on that in quite some time,  
16 but the recommendation here is to not allow rifles in  
17 these three WMUs. And this situation, I just feel,  
18 for the reasons stated, the safety issue, the sport,  
19 the fair chase aspect of hunting wild turkeys in the  
20 fall where there may be snow on the ground, I just  
21 think that I'm inclined to follow the recommendations  
22 of our biologist and not support this proposed  
23 amendment.

24                  MR. WEANER:

25                  Okay. Other discussion? Mr. Martone.

1                   MR. MARTONE:

2                   You know, I did ask the biologist  
3 yesterday if there was any biological concerns with  
4 this move. And at that time, I was told there is no  
5 biological concerns. Being from 1A and from this  
6 area, I understand the addition of rifles to this  
7 season, but we used high-powered rifles for big game  
8 hunting in this area, for deer and bear. And I just  
9 believe --- one of my biggest interests is  
10 simplification of the regulations. This not only  
11 simplifies the season, but it also across the board  
12 simplifies fluorescent orange regulations, which are  
13 somewhat of a nightmare at this point. So, any  
14 simplification in those senses is good to me. And I  
15 would encourage other commissioners to support this.  
16 Thank you.

17                   MR. WEANER:

18                   Commissioner Putnam.

19                   MR. PUTNAM:

20                   Regarding the safety issue, I don't  
21 believe we've ever had a hunting-related shooting  
22 incident where a hunter wearing orange was visible to  
23 the shooter has ever been shot by a turkey hunter with  
24 a rifle. Rifles are very deadly, but we have not shot  
25 any turkey hunters who were wearing orange that was

1 visible to the shooter.

2 MR. WEANER:

3 Further questions or comments? Hearing  
4 none, the motion again that we are voting on would  
5 allow rifles to be used for fall turkey hunting in  
6 Wildlife Management 1A, 1B and 2A. All those in  
7 favor, signify by raising one hand.

8 AYES RESPOND

9 MR. WEANER:

10 Hands down. All those opposed, raise one  
11 hand.

12 NAYS RESPOND

13 MR. WEANER:

14 Hands down.

15 MR. PUTNAM:

16 Mr. President, the motion passes with a  
17 vote of seven to one with Commissioner Boop being the  
18 negative vote.

19 MR. WEANER:

20 Thank you very much. Are there any  
21 further changes or discussion about page six? Hearing  
22 none, let's move over to page seven. Anything on page  
23 seven? Seeing none, let's turn over to the next page.  
24 Let's take all of page eight and the top of page nine,  
25 the things that deal with whitetail deer. Go ahead.

1                   MR. SCHREFFLER:

2                   Mr. President, I have an amendment to  
3 propose. And many of the hunters in the Wildlife  
4 Management Units with split seasons have been  
5 traveling to hunt in those with concurrent buck/doe  
6 seasons. in essence voting that they're in support of  
7 the concurrent seasons. And this is a result of an  
8 additional pressure on hunting grounds and the units  
9 that have concurrent seasons, especially apparent in  
10 Unit 4A, which is surrounded by units with split  
11 seasons. Hunters have given various reasons for this.  
12 The best chance for youth off from school to harvest  
13 any deer, work schedules, the split seasons limiting  
14 their opportunities, and out of state hunters  
15 especially also paying a lot for their licenses can't  
16 hunt a lot of times in those days.

17                   I would offer the following amendment to  
18 help our hunters in this situation. I would like to  
19 add Wildlife Management Unit 2C to the deer regular  
20 firearms, antlered and antlerless, November 26th to  
21 December 8th and remove Unit 2C from deer regular  
22 firearms antlered only November 26th to December 8th.

23                   MR. WEANER:

24                   So, the gist of your motion would be to  
25 add 2C into the concurrent season category?

1                   MR. SCHREFFLER:

2                   That's correct.

3                   MR. WEANER:

4                   Is there a second?

5                   MR. ISABELLA:

6                   Second.

7                   MR. WEANER:

8                   It's been properly moved and seconded.

9 Commissioner Isabella with the second. Is there any  
10 discussion? Go ahead.

11                   MR. MARTONE:

12                   I always like to defer to the  
13 commissioner from that area. And Commissioner  
14 Schreffler has some good ideas. However, I have  
15 concerns about this because 2C just moved into the  
16 split season. And I think it's not fair to our  
17 sportsmen to keep making changes year after year. I  
18 would like to see this stay where it is for at least  
19 three years. Get some idea of how things are actually  
20 working in this WMU. Get the feedback from the  
21 sportsmen after three years and then reconsider it.  
22 So, at this time, I'm not in support of this.

23                   MR. WEANER:

24                   Further questions or discussion? Go  
25 ahead.

1                   MR. SCHREFFLER:

2                   I have something to say. And that is  
3 that we tried it a year, we've gotten a lot of  
4 response back from hunters. And this Board has in the  
5 past changed things after one year, as a precedent.  
6 So, it wouldn't be unusual. And I think it would be  
7 very easy for the hunters to adapt to this already  
8 because most of them are already coming over to the 4A  
9 to take advantage of the concurrent seasons.

10                  MR. WEANER:

11                  Further discussion?

12                  MR. DELANEY:

13                  Mr. President, ---

14                  MR. WEANER:

15                  Go ahead.

16                  MR. DELANEY:

17                  --- Commissioner Schreffler just said  
18 that most of the hunters are going over to 4A to hunt.  
19 I don't know what accuracy there is to that.

20                  MR. SCHREFFLER:

21                  I'll relent to that.

22                  MR. WEANER:

23                  Further discussion? Hearing none, we  
24 have a motion to add 2C into the category of  
25 concurrent seasons. All those in favor, signify by

1 raising one hand.

2 AYES RESPOND

3 MR. WEANER:

4 Hands down. All those opposed, raise one  
5 hand.

6 NAYS RESPOND

7 MR. WEANER:

8 Hands down.

9 MR. PUTNAM:

10 Mr. President, the motion failed by a  
11 vote of five to three. Commissioner Putnam,  
12 Commissioner Schreffler and Commissioner Schlemmer  
13 voted ---.

14 MR. WEANER:

15 They voted in the affirmative. And the  
16 other five voted in the negative. The motion failed.  
17 Is there further discussion or any amendments to the  
18 deer section?

19 MR. SCHREFFLER:

20 Mr. President, ---

21 MR. WEANER:

22 Go ahead.

23 MR. SCHREFFLER:

24 --- I also would like to amend it to add  
25 Wildlife Management Unit 4B to deer regular firearms

1 antlered and antlerless, November 26th to December 8th  
2 and remove the 4B from deer regular firearm season  
3 antlered-only from November the 26th to December 8th.  
4 In other words, 4B would move into the concurrent  
5 season category.

6 MR. WEANER:

7 Okay. So, this is the same motion as  
8 before except we're now talking about 4B; correct?

9 MR. SCHREFFLER:

10 That's correct.

11 MR. WEANER:

12 Is there a second?

13 MR. ISABELLA:

14 Second.

15 MR. WEANER:

16 Commissioner Isabella seconds.

17 Discussion? All those in favor of this, signify by  
18 raising one hand.

19 AYES RESPOND

20 MR. WEANER:

21 Hands down. All those opposed, signify  
22 by raising one hand.

23 NAYS RESPOND

24 MR. WEANER:

25 Secretary?

1                   MR. PUTNAM:

2                   Mr. President, the motion fails with two  
3 affirmative votes, Commissioner Isabella and  
4 Commissioner Schreffler. And all the rest of the  
5 votes were negative. The motion fails.

6                   MR. WEANER:

7                   Thank you. Any other questions or any  
8 other discussion, comments, amendments on deer?

9                   MR. PUTNAM:

10                  Yes, Mr. President.

11                  MR. WEANER:

12                  Mr. Putnam.

13                  MR. PUTNAM:

14                  Mr. President, I have concerns about Unit  
15 3A. But I will not make any recommendations --- or  
16 make any amendments at this time. I would like to  
17 have --- wait until we see the numbers for this year  
18 come in. But I will tell you I have heard more  
19 comments from the eastern side of 3A concerning  
20 problems than I have from virtually any other area in  
21 the Northcentral.

22                  MR. WEANER:

23                  Okay. Commissioner Schreffler.

24                  MR. SCHREFFLER:

25                  Yes, Mr. President. I would like to

1 amend to add Wildlife Management Unit 4D to the deer  
2 regular firearms antlered and antlerless, November  
3 26th to December 8th and remove Unit 4D from the deer  
4 regular firearms antlered-only, November 26th to  
5 November 30th.

6 MR. WEANER:

7 Is there a second?

8 MR. ISABELLA:

9 Second.

10 MR. WEANER:

11 Commissioner Isabella seconds the motion.

12 The gist of your motion would be to make 4D a  
13 concurrent ---?

14 MR. SCHREFFLER:

15 That's correct. Yes.

16 MR. WEANER:

17 Okay. Same motion different --- WMU 4D  
18 is the one in question here. Any other discussion?

19 Hearing none, we shall proceed to vote. All those in  
20 favor of this motion, signify by raising one hand.

21 AYES RESPOND

22 MR. WEANER:

23 Hands down. All those opposed, signify  
24 by raising one hand.

25 NAYS RESPOND

1                   MR. WEANER:

2                   Hands down. Mr. Secretary?

3                   MR. PUTNAM:

4                   Mr. President, the motion fails by a vote  
5 of five --- of six to two. Commissioner Schreffler  
6 and Commissioner Isabella voted in the affirmative.  
7 All the others vote negative.

8                   MR. WEANER:

9                   Thank you very much. Any other  
10 discussion or amendments on deer? Hearing none, we're  
11 going to move on to black bear. Black bear is just on  
12 the bottom of page nine. Commissioner Martone?

13                   MR. MARTONE:

14                   Under black bear, the extended, which  
15 would be the category black bear extended November  
16 26th to December 1st. I would like to eliminate both  
17 the paragraph beginning with the portions of WMU 3B  
18 and portions of WMU 2G and move those two units to the  
19 very bottom of the page where it says black bear  
20 extended firearms November 28th to December 1st, which  
21 would now read 3B, 4C, 4D, 4E, 2G and 3D.

22                   MR. WEANER:

23                   Is there a second?

24                   MR. PUTNAM:

25                   Second.

1                   MR. WEANER:

2                   Commissioner Putnam seconds the motion.  
3 Okay. Before we go on to discussion, the gist of your  
4 motion, again, is items --- or WMUs 3A and 3C in their  
5 entirety would move down to the bottom category.

6                   MR. MARTONE:

7                   No.

8                   MR. WEANER:

9                   Restate your motion.

10                  MR. MARTONE:

11                  Okay. The first category, bear extended  
12 firearms November 26th to December 1st, the first line  
13 will remain the same, WMUs 3A and 3C. The rest of  
14 that will be eliminated. The portions of, the  
15 portions of, those two will move down to the last  
16 category on that page, bear extended firearms November  
17 28th to December 1st, which will now include 2G and  
18 3B.

19                  MR. WEANER:

20                  The motion's been properly moved and  
21 seconded, but go ahead and offer your discussion as to  
22 clarify it for us, please.

23                  MR. MARTONE:

24                  Well, after several discussions of these  
25 types --- first of all, my first objection was these

1 paragraphs become very, very difficult for anybody to  
2 identify the areas, except if you lived in one you  
3 could probably figure out where you're at and where  
4 you're not. And in discussions with Mark, the  
5 biologist, these were acceptable changes to those two  
6 WMUs. And so I feel that, for statistics' sake and to  
7 better manage our deer, those are acceptable moves.

8 MR. WEANER:

9 Thank you. Other discussion?

10 MR. DELANEY:

11 Yes. I have two concerns regarding bear.  
12 And the first, directed to Rob. I would ask, on page  
13 nine, there's two paragraphs in there with regard to  
14 3B, 2G and portions of. And I wonder if you can offer  
15 an explanation why it's in the agenda and what are our  
16 rationalization to have those two in here that have  
17 been there for years. I just need to know what that  
18 rationalization is if we're going to remove it.

19 MR. DUBROCK:

20 The two subunits, if you will, or  
21 portions of a Wildlife Management Unit that have been  
22 identified in the past are areas where there have been  
23 chronic problems with bear/human interactions. And  
24 the idea behind this at the time was to allow us to  
25 identify small areas to focus attention, to focus

1 hunting pressure on those particular areas to  
2 eliminate bears from those portions of the WMU rather  
3 than the WMU as a whole. That recommendation came out  
4 of staff discussions and interactions with our  
5 regional staff. They've been on the books for a  
6 number of years now. Since that time, we've  
7 implemented our suburban bear study, which has  
8 illustrated that bears move quite a bit and that while  
9 we may harvest bears in those areas, those bears are  
10 also available outside the area during regular hunting  
11 season as well. So, I think that's all I have to say  
12 at this point about the background. I would defer ---  
13 we do have Mark Ternent here, who is our bear  
14 biologist. If Mark has anything to add to that.

15 MR. TERNENT:

16 I think that's pretty accurate for the  
17 history.

18 MR. DELANEY:

19 Okay. The second is a follow up with  
20 regard to WMU 3D that's on page nine. While I'm not  
21 prepared to offer an amendment, we just had an  
22 excellent presentation from Biologist Ternent  
23 yesterday with regard to our bear program. And the  
24 only thing that stuck out to me as a Commissioner from  
25 Northeastern Pennsylvania was the harvest in 3D was

1 only ten percent compared to 30-some percent in 3D and  
2 3C. It just seemed really, grossly out of the  
3 ordinary. And we had some good discussions with that  
4 relative to that yesterday. I remain concerned about  
5 the bears that may be in downtown Scranton and  
6 Wilkes-Barre and some of the gated communities across  
7 the Pocono region. But I trust Biologist Terner's  
8 judgment. We've had some good discussions on it. I  
9 would just ask us to be vigilant as we go into the  
10 next season to monitor WMU 3D very closely because, as  
11 we said, that is an out of the ordinary thing.

12 MR. PUTNAM:

13 Commissioner Boop.

14 MR. BOOP:

15 Again, it was referenced yesterday in our  
16 policy manual to constituencies. And we already had  
17 the comment regarding the turkey hunting on the  
18 western part of the state. And I think as  
19 Commissioners we have to look at the whole picture,  
20 but yet we have to be sensitive where we're from.

21 And I'm from this area. Both part of 2G  
22 and 3B are in my district. And I certainly understand  
23 what Commissioner Martone is saying and the argument  
24 for simplicity. But having been on the Board a long  
25 time, it was --- a lot work went into these, what Mr.

1 DuBrock has referred to as subunits. In Lycoming  
2 County particularly, at the WCOs, we're just having  
3 very, very difficult problems with the bear  
4 concentrated in those areas where these subunits are  
5 delineated.

6                   We want to have bears in certain parts of  
7 the state. And certainly, I would think 2G and 3B are  
8 where we want to have bear. And I'm just little  
9 concerned, number one, that we're throwing out an  
10 awful lot of work that Mr. Dusza and the WCOs involved  
11 did in developing what I think has been a very  
12 successful approach in those areas. And the big  
13 groups that organize and drive for bears and are very  
14 successful, if we open all of 2G and all of 3B,  
15 they're not going to concentrate into these areas.  
16 And we certainly have the potential to see the kind of  
17 harvest we saw in 3A last year and not focus on the  
18 bears in these particular areas.

19                   So, I know we want to avoid this in the  
20 future, and we don't want to see a lot of other WMUs  
21 and have this type of language, but this has been in  
22 place for a number of years and it's worked well.  
23 And by voting in favor of this, we're just going to  
24 throw out a lot of hard work that I hate to see  
25 happen.

1                   MR. WEANER:

2                   Other comments? Commissioner Martone?

3                   MR. MARTONE:

4                   And I do agree with Commissioner Boop  
5 that a lot of hard work went into this. And I  
6 understand that it was at one time designed to solve a  
7 problem. But I think since then the science has  
8 changed. And if I'm not mistaken, Mr. DuBrock, this  
9 --- can you tell us, does the science still support  
10 these smaller units, or has it told us that we could  
11 be just as effective upon the WMU scale?

12                   MR. DUBROCK:

13                   I'm just wondering how the transcriber is  
14 recording my laugh. I'm not certain how to answer  
15 that at this point. I think it's difficult to say.  
16 We know that bears move around the landscape quite a  
17 bit. And so they're moving in and out of these  
18 smaller areas. It's more a reflection of where folks  
19 hunt and what's available to them and what's in season  
20 at the time. Bears are being taken in these small  
21 areas that are causing problems in those small areas.  
22 They're also being taken outside those smaller areas  
23 as well, because they do roam around the landscape.  
24 We've made no secret of the fact that from a hunting  
25 opportunity point of view and a management point of

1 view, we prefer the management, the WMU level, rather  
2 than fractured units. So that is the Bureau's  
3 position. And we believe we can address the issues on  
4 the landscape that, by doing so, we're not overly  
5 persecuting or devastating bear populations in the  
6 remainder of the management unit when we keep an  
7 entire unit open.

8                   Concerning 2G and extending the entirety  
9 of it, that does give me some pause for reflection.  
10 And I'm not saying it's a horrible idea. I'm saying  
11 that we do want to reflect on that a bit. It is the  
12 core of our bear range in central Pennsylvania. It's  
13 an area of low human population density, very low  
14 conflict with bears. And the bear population is  
15 healthy, and it has been steadily growing. So, could  
16 we take more bears and possibly stabilize that bear  
17 population? Probably. What will be the effect of a  
18 four-day season in the entire management unit for a  
19 deer season? It would simply be conjecture on our  
20 part. We can attempt to predict, but until it  
21 actually happens, it would be difficult to know. So,  
22 I think given the proposal, should this amendment  
23 pass, we're going to take a harder look at that and  
24 try to give you some additional information between  
25 now and April when a final decision is made. But that

1 is something that, as Commission Delaney said, the  
2 staff will remain diligent in reviewing the data and  
3 try to provide the best possible data we can for your  
4 deliberations.

5 MR. WEANER:

6 Thank you. Further discussion? Hearing  
7 none, we shall vote on Ralph's motion. For the  
8 record, Ralph, would you just restate your motion?

9 MR. MARTONE:

10 Under bear extended firearms, WMU 3A and  
11 3C November 26th to December 1st will be all that's  
12 under that category. At the bottom of the page, bear  
13 extended firearm November 28th to December 1st will  
14 now read 3D, 4C, 4D, 4E, 2G and 3B.

15 MR. WEANER:

16 Thank you very much. We shall now  
17 proceed to vote. All those in favor of this motion,  
18 signify by raising one hand.

19 AYES RESPOND

20 MR. WEANER:

21 Hands down. All those opposed to this  
22 motion, raise one hand.

23 NAYS RESPOND

24 MR. WEANER:

25 Mr. Secretary?

1                   MR. PUTNAM:

2                   Mr. President, the vote is four to four.

3                   MR. WEANER:

4                   And the four voting yes?

5                   MR. PUTNAM:

6                   The four voting yes are Commissioner  
7 Putnam, Commissioner Martone, Commissioner Schlemmer  
8 and Commissioner Isabella.

9                   MR. WEANER:

10                  And the rest voted no. A tie vote fails.  
11 The motion to amend has failed. Is there any other  
12 amendments on black bears or discussion on black  
13 bears? Okay. Turning over to the next page, elk.  
14 Anything on elk? Furtaking trapping information on  
15 page 10 and page 11? Okay. Hearing nothing here, we  
16 have an amended motion, and the amended motion makes  
17 these various changes that we've just gone through  
18 here, I will not restate all of them, but a vote right  
19 now is on pages 4 to 11 with the amendments that have  
20 passed. And this, of course, has to be voted on again  
21 for final adoption at the April meeting.

22                  And one thing I will interject here, one  
23 of the reasons why we go this way is to give people an  
24 opportunity to provide input. So, we're hoping that  
25 the public out there reads this stuff, hears this

1 stuff and provides us input because nothing is cast in  
2 stone until we vote in April again. So, we're now  
3 voting on the amended motion, pages 4 to 11, with the  
4 amendments. All those in favor, signify by raising  
5 one hand.

6 AYES RESPOND

7 MR. WEANER:

8 Hands down. Any that oppose? Secretary?

9 MR. PUTNAM:

10 Mr. President, the motion passes eight to  
11 nothing.

12 MR. WEANER:

13 Unanimously, all voting yes. Thank you.  
14 We are over on page 12 of your agenda.

15 MR. BECHTEL:

16 The next item to come before the  
17 Commission is an amendment to 58 PA Code Section  
18 141.1. Agricultural deer damage continues to be a  
19 challenge in the Commonwealth's more developed areas.  
20 Special hunting regulations exist for these areas, but  
21 hunting and permitted control provisions at times  
22 create conflicting regulations. The amendment to  
23 Section 141.1(d)(6) will permit hunters to legally  
24 harvest deer during any deer season through the use of  
25 bait on properties authorized under a valid deer

1 control permit known as red tag farms in WMUs 5C and  
2 5D in the southeastern Pennsylvania special  
3 regulations areas. The text is shown on page 12 of  
4 your agenda.

5 MR. WEANER:

6 Thank you. Is there a motion to approve  
7 this?

8 MR. SCHREFFLER:

9 So moved.

10 MR. ISABELLA:

11 Second.

12 MR. WEANER:

13 Commissioner Schreffler moves.

14 Commissioner Isabella seconds the motion. Discussion?  
15 Hearing none, all those in favor of this, signify by  
16 saying aye.

17 AYES RESPOND

18 MR. WEANER:

19 Those opposed, say no.

20 MR. PUTNAM:

21 Mr. President, the vote is passed  
22 unanimously.

23 MR. WEANER:

24 Thank you.

25 MR. BECHTEL:

1                   The next item is the amendment of 58 PA  
2 Code Section 141.28 concerning the Pike Run Wild  
3 Pheasant Recovery Area. This study area in  
4 southwestern Pennsylvania has concluded  
5 unsuccessfully. Habitat patch analysis shows the Pike  
6 Run meets only one of five habitat targets in the  
7 pheasant model. Pheasant densities are at one hen per  
8 square mile, far short of the ten hens per square mile  
9 objective.

10                   In light of the area's habitat  
11 characteristics and low pheasant densities, and in  
12 keeping with the pheasant management plan, it is  
13 proposed that this area be open to either-sex pheasant  
14 hunting and stocking of game farm pheasants being  
15 reinstated beginning with the 2012 to 2013 season. To  
16 complement this proposed season change, Section 141.28  
17 will need to be amended to delete the Pike Run Wild  
18 Pheasant Restoration Area description as illustrated  
19 on page 13 of your text. Additionally, amending  
20 Section 141.28(b)(2) to include crows along with  
21 waterfowl and woodchucks to the list of species that  
22 can be hunted within WPRAs from the first Sunday in  
23 February through July 31st is being proposed.

24                   MR. WEANER:

25                   Is there a motion to approve this?

1                   MR. ISABELLA:

2                   Motion.

3                   MR. WEANER:

4                   Commissioner Isabella moves. Is there a  
5 second?

6                   MR. PUTNAM:

7                   Second.

8                   MR. WEANER:

9                   Second by Commissioner Putnam.

10 Discussion? Commissioner Delaney?

11                   MR. DELANEY:

12                   There's just language that conflicts with  
13 proposal 139.4. So, I'm just not sure how we proceed  
14 from here. According to this, either-sex pheasant  
15 hunting it says is open in Pike Run. Yet in 2A, under  
16 season of bag limits, we made it a cock bird only  
17 area. So, Mr. President or Executive Director, can  
18 you address that?

19                   MR. WEANER:

20                   Yeah. The commentary, we're not voting  
21 on the commentary. It's just an explanation. As you  
22 already amended it, these are the bag limits. You're  
23 voting on removing Pike Run as a Wild Pheasant  
24 Restoration Area. That's the change in the regulatory  
25 process.

1                   MR. DELANEY:

2                   Yeah. And my only concern is that it  
3 reads this area to be open to either-sex pheasant  
4 hunting.

5                   MR. WEANER:

6                   And you've already amended that situation  
7 in the seasons and bag limits. And you're not voting  
8 on the commentary.

9                   MR. DELANEY:

10                  Good enough for me.

11                  MR. WEANER:

12                  Other discussion? So everyone is clear  
13 here, we are simply with this motion, if it were to  
14 pass, it simply eliminates Pike Run as a Wild Pheasant  
15 Recovery Area. It doesn't affect what we did back in  
16 seasons and bag limits. And it adds crows and  
17 waterfowl and woodchuck. And other discussion?  
18 Hearing none, we shall vote. All those in favor of  
19 this, signify by raising one hand.

20 AYES RESPOND

21                  MR. WEANER:

22                  Hands down. All those opposed?  
23 Secretary?

24                  MR. PUTNAM:

25                  Mr. President, the motion passes

1 unanimously.

2 MR. WEANER:

3 Thank you. We're now over to page 15.

4 MR. BECHTEL:

5 The next item concerns the amendment 58  
6 PA Code Section 141.62. To comply with the beaver  
7 management plan, two regulation changes are needed in  
8 58 PA Code Section 141.62. The 15-foot trap placement  
9 restriction near beaver dams and lodges should be  
10 enforced statewide, which will simplify regulations  
11 and help protect juvenile beavers in the colony. This  
12 will be accomplished by deleting references to the  
13 Wildlife Management Units 3B, 3C and 3D as indicated  
14 below in the text on page 15.

15 Secondly, the body-gripping trap limit of  
16 ten should only apply to WMUs with high relative  
17 harvest complaint density and with bag limits of 40  
18 beavers per season. The purpose of this change is to  
19 lift the two body-gripping trap limit only in WMUs  
20 with high relative beaver harvest and complaint  
21 densities. Limiting body-gripping traps also creates  
22 beaver trapping opportunities for the maximum number  
23 of trappers. This change can be accommodated as noted  
24 in Section 141.62(b)(4) on page 15.

25 MR. WEANER:

1 Is there a motion?

2 MR. ISABELLA:

3 Motion.

4 MR. SCHLEMMER:

5 Second.

6 MR. WEANER:

7 Commissioner Isabella moves.

8 Commissioner Schlemmer seconds the motion. Is there  
9 any discussion here? Hearing none, we shall vote.

10 All those in favor, signify by saying aye.

11 AYES RESPOND

12 MR. WEANER:

13 Those opposed, say no.

14 MR. PUTNAM:

15 Mr. President, the motion passes  
16 unanimously.

17 MR. WEANER:

18 Thank you.

19 MR. BECHTEL:

20 The next action is the amendment of 58 PA  
21 Code Section 147.804. The National Wild Turkey  
22 Federation and others have continued to express an  
23 interest in having the Commission expand mentored  
24 youth turkey hunting opportunities to include fall  
25 turkeys. Commission staff has expressed conditional

1 support so long as fall turkey harvest would not  
2 increase. The Board has the ability to modify 58 PA  
3 Code to allow for the transfer of a mentor fall turkey  
4 tag. This action will not significantly increase the  
5 fall harvest or negatively impact the ongoing fall hen  
6 harvest rate and survival study and is consistent with  
7 the goal of providing additional mentored youth  
8 hunting opportunity as identified in the wild turkey  
9 management plan for Pennsylvania. The changes are  
10 shown on page 16 of your agenda.

11 MR. WEANER:

12 Is there a motion to approve?

13 MR. ISABELLA:

14 Motion.

15 MR. WEANER:

16 Commissioner Isabella moves. Is there a  
17 second?

18 MR. MARTONE:

19 Second.

20 MR. WEANER:

21 Commissioner Martone seconds the motion.

22 Any discussion?

23 MR. DELANEY:

24 Yes, Mr. President. I just want to offer  
25 one point. I want to give Commissioner Martone some

1 credit here, too, because I believe he's the one that  
2 actually stimulated the thought based on what the  
3 National Wild Turkey Federation had to say. But  
4 really we had some good discussions going. So, I just  
5 wanted to commend him for at least getting this on the  
6 table and getting the conversation started.

7 MR. WEANER:

8 Other discussion? Hearing none, we shall  
9 vote. All those in favor, signify by saying aye.

10 AYES RESPOND

11 MR. WEANER:

12 Those opposed, say no.

13 MR. PUTNAM:

14 Mr. President, the motion passes  
15 unanimously.

16 MR. WEANER:

17 Thank you.

18 MR. BECHTEL:

19 The next action proposes to amend 58 PA  
20 Code Section 135.50, which currently defines the term  
21 ATV, All Terrain Vehicle, for the purpose of  
22 restricting the type and design of off-road vehicles  
23 that may be operated on State Game Lands under  
24 applicable allowances. Section 135.5 contains  
25 specific reference to sections of the Vehicle Code to

1 aid in defining this term. The relevant portions of  
2 the Vehicle Code were changed on June 25th, 2001 and  
3 changed the meanings given to the terms All Terrain  
4 Vehicle and ATV. The 2001 changes to the Vehicle Code  
5 were never incorporated into 58 PA Code Section 135.5.  
6 The Commission is proposing to amend Section 135.5 to  
7 eliminate references to subsection three of the  
8 Vehicle Code, which no longer exists under Title 75,  
9 and replace them with a generic exclusory reference.  
10 This proposal is non-substantive and is not intended  
11 to further expand or further limit the types of  
12 off-road vehicles that may be operated on State Game  
13 Lands under applicable allowances.

14 MR. WEANER:

15 Is there a motion to approve?

16 MR. ISABELLA:

17 Motion.

18 MR. WEANER:

19 Commissioner Isabella. Is there a  
20 second?

21 MR. SCHLEMMER:

22 Second.

23 MR. WEANER:

24 Commissioner Schlemmer. We have a motion  
25 and a second. Director Palmer, do you want to just

1 give us the gist of this? Basically, it's no change;  
2 right?

3 MR. PALMER:

4 Yes, Mr. President. Essentially it's  
5 just a housekeeping item. The section of the  
6 applicable law, Title 75, was amended and the  
7 regulations never caught up with that amendment. If  
8 you look, it's basically the paragraph of the section  
9 that changes it from item three to item one. It's  
10 purely an administrative amendment.

11 MR. WEANER:

12 We're not going to have the Game Lands  
13 overrun by ATVs.

14 MR. PALMER:

15 That's correct, Mr. President.

16 MR. WEANER:

17 Thank you. Go ahead.

18 MR. ISABELLA:

19 I just realized. Does this mean that I  
20 can't take my ATV on 326 anymore?

21 MR. PALMER:

22 That's correct.

23 MR. ISABELLA:

24 I'm only kidding.

25 MR. WEANER:

1           Any other discussion? All those in favor  
2 of this motion, signify by saying aye.

3 AYES RESPOND

4           MR. WEANER:

5           Those opposed, say no.

6           MR. PUTNAM:

7           Mr. President, the motion passes  
8 unanimously.

9           MR. WEANER:

10          Thank you.

11          MR. BECHTEL:

12          The next item the Commission is proposing  
13 to amend is Section 141.4 of 58 PA Code to replace the  
14 current hunting hours table and migratory bird hunting  
15 hours table to accurately reflect the dates and hours  
16 of legal hunting for the 2012-2013 hunting license  
17 year. These tables are shown on page 19 and 20 of  
18 your agenda.

19          MR. WEANER:

20          Do we have a motion to approve?

21          MR. ISABELLA:

22          Motion.

23          MR. WEANER:

24          Commissioner Isabella moves.

25          Commissioner Schlemmer, do you want to second this

1 motion?

2 MR. SCHLEMMER:

3 Second.

4 MR. WEANER:

5 Thanks, guys down there at the end of the  
6 table. We have a motion and a second. Any  
7 discussion? Seeing none, we shall vote. All those in  
8 favor, signify by saying aye.

9 AYES RESPOND

10 MR. WEANER:

11 Those opposed, say no.

12 MR. PUTNAM:

13 Mr. President, the motion passes  
14 unanimously.

15 MR. WEANER:

16 Okay. Thank you. This moves us up to  
17 page 21.

18 MR. BECHTEL:

19 Yes. On page 21, the Commission proposes  
20 to amend 58 PA Code Section 141.43 and 141.44. On  
21 January 27th, 2009, the Commission adopted amendments  
22 to those sections relating to deer and bear that,  
23 inter alia, authorized the general use of crossbows  
24 during archery deer and bear seasons. The crossbow  
25 amendments in these provisions are subject to a sunset

1 provision that expires on June 30th, 2012. The  
2 Commission is proposing to amend those sections to  
3 eliminate the sunset language to effectively make  
4 permanent the authorized general use of crossbows  
5 during archery deer and bear seasons. The text is  
6 shown on pages 21 and 22 of your agenda.

7 MR. WEANER:

8 Is there a motion to approve?

9 MR. ISABELLA:

10 Motion.

11 MR. WEANER:

12 Commissioner Isabella. Is there a  
13 second?

14 MR. MARTONE:

15 Second.

16 MR. WEANER:

17 Commissioner Martone second. Discussion?  
18 Mr. Boop?

19 MR. BOOP:

20 We're on crossbows. We knew we were  
21 going to get here.

22 MR. WEANER:

23 Yeah.

24 MR. BOOP:

25 Crossbows has not been the sport's finest

1 hour. I think that most of us who have been serving  
2 on the Board would agree. I have a lot of concerns  
3 about this particular agenda item. Other than just  
4 sort of the general deer situation, which is a whole  
5 other matter, I don't think anything in my tenure has  
6 generated as much emotion and has caused as much  
7 difficulty for this Board. I'm particularly concerned  
8 I guess in several areas. Number one, I have a lot of  
9 acquaintances and people I've come in contact with who  
10 say you ruined my sport. We've heard that here on  
11 Sunday. And I've heard it numerous times. And I  
12 don't know what we say to those people other than it  
13 was just a decision of the Board and that we need to  
14 move on. But I do feel for those people, including  
15 one very good personal friend of mine, who every time  
16 I see him says you ruined my sport.

17                   The second issue that concerns me with  
18 crossbows generally is that --- now, I've heard all  
19 the arguments that there's really no difference  
20 between a crossbow and a compound bow or a traditional  
21 or a recurve, but I think we only need to look at the  
22 statistics we saw yesterday for the success in the  
23 archery bear season and to see what percentage of the  
24 bear were taken by crossbows as opposed to compounds.  
25 A lot of people argue pretty persuasively that they're

1 a short range gun. I'm not going to be here, but I  
2 think this Board is going to have to take a look in  
3 future years at where these harvest numbers are going  
4 because we're all hearing, as Commissioners, from the  
5 rifle hunters, is there going to be anything left for  
6 us. As we're approaching 40 percent of the buck  
7 harvest coming from the archery season. And I think  
8 we can all look at the numbers and argue the numbers.  
9 Like it or not --- and I think our biologists tell us  
10 at almost every meeting that our rifle hunters are our  
11 most efficient way of managing our deer. And if we  
12 want to preserve camp life and the traditions that we  
13 all have been a part of, there's going to have to be  
14 something left for the archery hunters.

15                   So, I think long term, the use of  
16 crossbows probably is going to mean, unfortunately,  
17 the shortening of the archery season as the kill goes  
18 up because if you look at any paper across the state  
19 in the fall and you look at the bucks being taken, not  
20 only is it approaching 40 percent, but some of the  
21 best ones that are out there. And does it interfere  
22 with the breeding ecology? I think that's something  
23 the biologists have to answer. We do have the junior  
24 bucks out there. And certainly they're capable of  
25 doing the breeding. But this is something that's

1 going to haunt us, I think, for a long time.

2                   And having said all that, for those  
3 families that bought crossbows for their children and  
4 the people that went out and bought them and the  
5 retailers that stock them in their stores all across  
6 the state, I can't in good conscience vote against  
7 allowing them to continue. But I think this is going  
8 to be an issue that's going to dog the Board for years  
9 to come. And I wish it had been different, but it  
10 wasn't. And I think we're going to just have to deal  
11 with it as we go forward.

12                   MR. WEANER:

13                   Thank you. Commissioner Isabella?

14                   MR. ISABELLA:

15                   Tom, we'll have to disagree one more  
16 time.

17                   MR. BOOP:

18                   We always do, Greg.

19                   MR. ISABELLA:

20                   Well, we entered the sunset three years  
21 ago. We heard a lot of concerns of what was going to  
22 happen. 200,000 to 300,000 rifle hunters were going  
23 to come over; that didn't materialize. There was  
24 going to be a massive harvest of bucks; that didn't  
25 materialize. The breeding bucks were not damaged,

1 that didn't materialize. One big advantage --- two  
2 big advantages that this happened is we got some of  
3 the older hunters to stay active and continue to hunt  
4 because they're hunting now in the archery season  
5 where maybe in the wintertime they wouldn't be  
6 hunting. That's a positive.

7                   We were talking about retention. When  
8 you go to these youth field days, you're going to see  
9 an archery area. You're going to see eight- or  
10 nine-year-olds shooting junior compound bows just to  
11 stir up their interest and hoping that they either get  
12 in a venture like a few years down the road or they  
13 acquire a hunting license. Most importantly, which is  
14 not being talked about, is the excise tax that is  
15 coming from the purchase of a crossbow or related  
16 accessories because of the Pittman Robertson Fund.  
17 And that goes right back into hunting activities.  
18 Lastly, the states that I know that have been in  
19 crossbow hunting, a lot of these concerns have not  
20 materialized. So, yeah, I'm leaving the Board also,  
21 and I'm sure that our deer team will be monitoring the  
22 situation. And let's just hope that this was a good  
23 activity for deer hunters. Thank you, Mr. President.

24                   MR. WEANER:

25                   Go ahead.

1                   MR. MARTONE:

2                   Those are two tough acts to follow, but I  
3 would like to weigh in on this. Commissioner Boop's  
4 right. We are watching the harvest closely, but it  
5 has trended upwards, even before crossbows. The  
6 archery season is one of the places we sell more  
7 licenses consistently. We're adding more archers  
8 every year prior to crossbows. And it just continued  
9 when crossbows were added. One thing I looked at was  
10 the hunter's survey for 2010-11. It showed archers  
11 spent 2,726,908 days afield. Rifle hunters spent a  
12 little bit more at 3,181,711 days afield. When you  
13 look at the harvest, archers spent about 9.4 days to  
14 harvest a buck, where rifle hunters spent 3.4. That's  
15 almost three times as much time in the field to  
16 harvest that deer. And excuse the pun, but that's a  
17 lot more recreational bang for our buck when it comes  
18 to providing recreation for archery. And if the  
19 archers are choosing crossbow, then I think we've done  
20 the right thing. Thank you.

21                   MR. WEANER:

22                   Further comment?

23                   MR. SCHREFFLER:

24                   Yes.

25                   MR. WEANER:

1                   Go ahead.

2                   MR. SCHREFFLER:

3                   I would just like to comment about my  
4 concerns with the increasing harvest of bucks. It  
5 seems that more bucks are being harvested of course,  
6 and that somewhat the habits of the deer have been  
7 changed by added pressure. And I think it concerns  
8 our rifle hunters. They seem to be sort of the last  
9 ones to get added opportunity. And here when we see  
10 the pre-rifle season numbers increasing, numbers of  
11 harvesting bucks are increasing, and I think this  
12 really requires our Bureau of Wildlife Management to  
13 practice a great deal of vigilance on this because  
14 these are concerns that I have. But I, too, as Mr.  
15 Boop, hear a lot of people in the rifle season saying  
16 we're the last ones to be considered for a lot of  
17 opportunities. And it seems like a lot of good bucks  
18 and a lot of deer are taken before we have our  
19 opportunity. So, I think we have to keep that in mind  
20 as we go through this.

21                   MR. BOOP:

22                   Just one aspect I didn't touch on. I  
23 don't want to repeat anything. This has gone on a  
24 little bit anyway. But both on this Board and as a  
25 municipal solicitor for almost 40 years, I just have

1 not had a good experience with sunset provisions. And  
2 I just would like to make that comment for whatever  
3 the Board wants to --- how they want to consider it.  
4 I think in this case, the sunset provision was put in  
5 to try to sell this to get the last vote three years  
6 ago. But my experience, both as municipal solicitor  
7 and here, you can't get something and then come back  
8 three years later and take it away. So, I just think  
9 that future initiatives come up in the future, you  
10 know, just we have not had a debating situation  
11 earlier in the southeast. Just the sunset provisions  
12 don't work very well.

13 MR. WEANER:

14 Any other comments?

15 Mr. Weaner:

16 One last comment I would add is my views  
17 on this issue have not changed. I agree with  
18 Commissioner Boop mostly 100 percent on this issue.  
19 And I also agree with him that the battle was lost in  
20 2009, and to think that we could take crossbows away  
21 now would make a firestorm that none of us ever want  
22 to even think about. So, I'm going to be voting in  
23 favor of this motion as well.

24 MR. WEANER:

25 And last comments?

1                   MR. DELANEY:

2                   Yeah.

3                   MR. WEANER:

4                   Mr. Delaney?

5                   MR. DELANEY:

6                   I feel like I'm the caboose on this  
7 discussion. But I voted no for the first round, but I  
8 learned I think over the last several years that  
9 crossbows are good for the sport of hunting. There  
10 are a lot of folks that say but you perceive this and  
11 you perceive that. I think we deal in the facts. The  
12 facts are that the harvest has increased with the use  
13 of crossbows. Not necessarily just because of the  
14 crossbow, but because of the crossbows and the SRAs.  
15 In general though, the harvest has increased. I'm  
16 from the Northcentral Region --- I'm sorry, the  
17 Northeast Region, and we do have a lot of camps. And  
18 I believe that rifle deer hunting drives the  
19 Pennsylvania Game Commission like football drives Penn  
20 State University. I think we have to watch the  
21 harvest and find the balance in how much is too much.  
22 But in general, I'm not going to oppose it. I agree  
23 with what most of us said here. You know, we're into  
24 this. Too many folks have bought them and they have  
25 done a lot of good. A lot of kids use them. A lot of

1 adults use them. So, I think it's been very good for  
2 us, but as we move forward, I think we need to be  
3 really cautious and watch the deer harvest. Thank  
4 you.

5 MR. WEANER:

6 Okay. We're going to vote in this  
7 motion. A yes vote on this motion will make permanent  
8 the use of crossbows. All those in favor of this  
9 motion, signify by raising one hand.

10 AYES RESPOND

11 MR. WEANER:

12 Hands down. Those opposed? Secretary?

13 MR. PUTNAM:

14 Mr. President, the motion passes  
15 unanimously.

16 MR. WEANER:

17 Thank you. We move over to page 23.

18 MR. BECHTEL:

19 The next items concern acquisitions.  
20 Contract number 3596, State Game Land number 235 in  
21 Franklin County. Ricky and Arlin Wadel are offering  
22 for sale 60, more or less, acres of land in St. Thomas  
23 Township, Franklin County, adjoining State Game Land  
24 number 235 as shown on Exhibit Red One on page 24.  
25 The option price is \$117,436, lump sum to be paid from

1 the Game Fund. This indenture into State Game Land  
2 number 235 is forested. Broad Run, which is a Class A  
3 wild trout stream, runs through the northwest corner  
4 of the property.

5                   Contract number 3597, State Game Land  
6 number 207 in Luzerne County. The Earth Conservancy  
7 is offering for sale 406.55 more or less acres of land  
8 in Hanover and Fairview Townships, Luzerne County,  
9 adjoining State Game Land number 207 as shown on  
10 Exhibit Red Two on page 25 of your agenda. The option  
11 price is \$243,930, lump sum. The option reserves all  
12 coal, oil, gas and other minerals, but not including  
13 uranium or any other radioactive minerals. The Earth  
14 Conservancy, however, shall not enter into any sale or  
15 lease for removal of coal, oil, gas or other minerals  
16 through the surface without the written consent of the  
17 Game Commission. After January 1st of 2032, the coal,  
18 oil, gas and other minerals shall revert to the Game  
19 Commission with 50 percent of any future revenue  
20 received by the Game Commission being allocated for  
21 Earth Conservancy. The property is forested with  
22 mixed oak on top of the mountain and northern  
23 hardwoods in the lower areas. The timber has been cut  
24 in some areas with early successional habitat. The  
25 property shall be paid for with third-party

1 commitments for compensation of habitat and  
2 recreational losses.

3           Contract number 3598, State Game Land  
4 number 106 in Berks County. Lennia Kutz or Kutz  
5 (changes pronunciation) is offering for sale 27 more  
6 or less acres of land in Albany Township, Berks  
7 County, adjoining State Game Land number 106 as shown  
8 on Exhibit Red Three on page 26. The option price is  
9 \$42,120, lump sum. There has been much interest  
10 expressed by the National Wild Turkey Federation and  
11 local sportsmen's groups to contribute to the purchase  
12 of this property. The remainder shall be paid from  
13 third party commitments for compensation of habitat  
14 and recreational losses. The property is forested.  
15 And acquiring the property will provide protection for  
16 two species of special concern, one under the  
17 jurisdiction of the Game Commission and the other  
18 under the jurisdiction of the Pennsylvania Fish and  
19 Boat Commission.

20                   MR. WEANER:

21                   Okay. We have these three land  
22 purchases. Is there a motion to approve?

23                   MR. ISABELLA:

24                   Motion.

25                   MR. WEANER:

1 Commissioner Isabella moves.

2 MR. SCHREFFLER:

3 Second.

4 MR. WEANER:

5 Commissioner Schreffler seconds the  
6 motion. Any discussion?

7 MR. DELANEY:

8 Yes.

9 MR. WEANER:

10 Go ahead.

11 MR. DELANEY:

12 Real quick. Particularly the properties  
13 in Luzerne County, in the Northeast Region, and Bill  
14 can put this together, but the proposed acquisition  
15 coming from the Earth Conservancy, I just need to give  
16 them accolades, too, because they are a company that  
17 had a lot of coal properties that in addition to them  
18 offering this sale for us, they have more than 1,000  
19 acres in the public access. So, they've long been a  
20 good partner for the Pennsylvania Game Commission.  
21 And personally, as a sportsman from northeastern  
22 Pennsylvania, that the value of this additional 406  
23 acres in Luzerne County is phenomenal with the  
24 watershed and the habitat values that are in that  
25 area. So, good work.

1                   MR. WEANER:

2                   Other comments? Go ahead.

3                   MR. ISABELLA:

4                   Bill, this will be my last time talking  
5 to you up here. I just want you to know that you, the  
6 team and the regional directors over the past eight  
7 years have really brought together some excellent  
8 property. You stole some. But you got some excellent  
9 properties for these hunters of Pennsylvania. And  
10 they really have to realize what you bring to the  
11 table here, you and your team, and the properties that  
12 you brought over to the Game Commission. I'm going to  
13 miss your reports, but other than that, I want to give  
14 you and your guys a thumbs up.

15                   MR. BOOP:

16                   I guess I might as well make a comment  
17 now. I'm not sure if Greg was kidding with the  
18 comment stolen, but you certainly had made some very  
19 good acquisitions that have been in favor of the  
20 Commission and the sportsmen and women of this state.  
21 And as someone who does some of this in another life,  
22 I'm always impressed with what you bring to the table  
23 with you and your team. And this is just another  
24 example. And I know different people have made the  
25 comment you can't go wrong buying or acquiring dirt.

1 And you certainly acquired a lot of dirt during the  
2 last eight-plus years I've been here, you and your  
3 department and your predecessors. And that's true  
4 pretty much of all the folks here in the agency that I  
5 have to pile on with Greg on this one. It's a rare  
6 chance where I get to agree with him. So, I couldn't  
7 let it pass.

8 MR. WEANER:

9 Other comments? All those in favor of  
10 these --- of approving this motion, signify by saying  
11 aye.

12 AYES RESPOND

13 MR. WEANER:

14 Those opposed, say no.

15 MR. PUTNAM:

16 Mr. President, the motion passes  
17 unanimously.

18 MR. WEANER:

19 Thank you. We're over on page 27, land  
20 exchange.

21 MR. BECHTEL:

22 Next we're looking at two land exchanges.  
23 The first is with the Pennsylvania Department of  
24 Transportation. They are offering 65.38 acres of land  
25 in Somerset and Black Townships, Somerset County

1 adjacent to State Game Land number 50 as a replacement  
2 for land for 22.14 acres of State Game Land number 50  
3 as shown on Exhibit Red Four on page 28 of your  
4 agenda. An additional 21.508 acres shall be vacated  
5 back to the Commission upon completion of the project.  
6 In addition, 25.19 acres shall become part of a future  
7 PennDOT land bank. The conveyance to the Commission  
8 contains mixed hardwoods recovering from a clear cut  
9 with two small, old reverting fields. And a small  
10 tributary, headwaters to Laurel Run, runs through a  
11 section of the property.

12                   The other exchange is with the Department  
13 of Conservation and National Resources. DCNR is  
14 offering 291.43 more or less acres of land adjacent to  
15 State Game Land number 311 in Benezette Township, Elk  
16 County in exchange for 291.36 acres of State Game Land  
17 number 311 as shown on Exhibit Red Five on page 29 of  
18 your agenda. The two agencies have negotiated this  
19 exchange to enhance the two separate agencies'  
20 abilities to meet their independent objectives and  
21 benefit the general public's use of these lands. The  
22 tract conveyed to DCNR is detached from the main  
23 portion of State Game Land. And the tract being  
24 transferred from DCNR adjoins existing State Game Land  
25 number 311. The exchange will also help the DCNR

1 alleviate an existing dangerous condition where  
2 horseback riding has been occurring along a narrow  
3 busy section of Highway Route 555. No horse trails  
4 are on the acreage being conveyed to the Game  
5 Commission. Both tracts are forested. And the  
6 acreage DCNR is transferring to the Game Commission  
7 has three herbaceous openings that are currently being  
8 maintained by the Game Commission's Food and Cover  
9 Corps.

10 MR. WEANER:

11 Is there a motion to approve this?

12 MR. SCHLEMMER:

13 Motion.

14 MR. WEANER:

15 Commissioner Schlemmer. Is there a  
16 second?

17 MR. DELANEY:

18 Second.

19 MR. WEANER:

20 Commissioner Delaney seconds the motion.

21 Discussion? Go ahead.

22 MR. MARTONE:

23 I'd like to point out this land exchange  
24 with DCNR. We did a very excellent land exchange with  
25 the Clarion River exchange with DCNR that came out in

1 favor for both agencies. And I think the Pennsylvania  
2 Game Commission benefited greatly from that. This is  
3 another example of how the two agencies are working  
4 closely together. And I have to give Director  
5 Capouillez a lot of credit. These are not easy things  
6 to do between state agencies. The bureaucracy, I'm  
7 sure, is somewhat of a nightmare. But when both  
8 agencies can benefit so much, and this type of  
9 exchange up in the elk country is beneficial to us.  
10 It's certainly beneficial to DCNR. They have to be  
11 commended for making this happen. And I want to say  
12 thank you.

13 MR. WEANER:

14 Other discussion? We are now going to  
15 vote on the motion to approve these. All those in  
16 favor, signify by saying aye.

17 AYES RESPOND

18 MR. WEANER:

19 Those opposed, say no. Secretary?

20 MR. PUTNAM:

21 Mr. President, the motion passed  
22 unanimously.

23 MR. WEANER:

24 Thank you. We now move over to page 30.

25 MR. BECHTEL:

1                   Yes. Page 30. Subject to certain  
2 limitations, Section 135.241 of 58 PA Code authorizes  
3 the director to bid on real estate, oil, gas or  
4 mineral rights at auction or tax sale and to request  
5 down payment checks to bid on property at auction.  
6 Successful bids must be made known to the general  
7 public at the next regularly scheduled meeting of the  
8 Board of Commissioners.

9                   On August 19th, 2011, the Game Commission  
10 was the successful bidder at a tax sale held at the  
11 Cambria County Courthouse and purchased the mineral  
12 rights or fractural interests thereof on nine tracts,  
13 ten different control numbers, located in Blacklick,  
14 Reade and Dean Townships, Cambria County under State  
15 Game Land number 79 as shown on Red Six on page 32 and  
16 108 as shown Exhibit Red Seven on page 33. Each of  
17 these tracts had a different price. Each tax parcel  
18 number and the price and the fractional interest is  
19 all detailed in your agenda on page 30.

20                   On Contract number 3594, State Game Land  
21 number 88 in Juniata County, on August 26th, 2011,  
22 notice was received from the Southcentral Region that  
23 the estate of George M. Stewart was offering for sale  
24 five separate tracts of land totaling 369 more or less  
25 acres in Spruce Hill Township, Juniata County at a

1 public auction to be held September 24th, 2011. The  
2 property adjoins State Game Land number 88 as shown on  
3 Exhibit Red Eight on page 34. The Game Commission was  
4 the successful bidder on tract number three, totaling  
5 65.96 acres with a bid of \$400,000, which was paid  
6 with escrowed funds from the land exchange on State  
7 Game Land number 176 with the Pennsylvania State  
8 University and required approval from the United  
9 States Fish and Wildlife Service. The property,  
10 located on the northern slope of Tuscarora Mountain,  
11 provides access to a large inaccessible portion of  
12 State Game Land number 88. A five-acre portion of the  
13 tract is an herbaceous opening currently managed as a  
14 hayfield. A diverse hardwood forest is present with  
15 hickory, white oak, red maple, black birch, sugar  
16 maple, tulip poplar and a scattering of conifers.  
17 Headwaters of an unnamed creek flow through the  
18 property.

19 MR. WEANER:

20 Is there a motion to approve this?

21 MR. BECHTEL:

22 These are informational items, Mr.  
23 President.

24 MR. WEANER:

25 Let me ask one question while Director

1 Capouillez is here. These fractural interests in ---  
2 that we bought, why is that important?

3 MR. CAPOUILLEZ:

4 Those areas had surface mining and deep  
5 mining coal in the past. And we did not own that  
6 coal. And in particular, that was a strategic play on  
7 the Game Commission's part to acquire those  
8 outstanding interests. With coal prices fluctuating  
9 up and down and now coal-bed methane gas starting to  
10 be more prevalent, surface usage, description of  
11 non-minerals, all those things are really starting to  
12 be picked up on in tax sales. In particular, some of  
13 that gain was on 108. There's an upper coal seam  
14 there, which is a very nice coal seam. It's only  
15 about 18 inches thick, which we were able to purchase  
16 that. Had we not been able to do that, that entire  
17 interior of the Game Land could have been subject to  
18 surface mining and we would have had no control in  
19 that area. And that's why some of those bids actually  
20 went pretty high. There were intents for people to  
21 acquire that and to start to move towards mining.

22 MR. WEANER:

23 Okay. Thank you. We're now on page 35.

24 MR. BECHTEL:

25 The last item before the Commission is

1 the Gob Gas Production Agreement on State Game Land  
2 number 223 in Greene County. Alpha Natural Resources,  
3 Alpha, has requested an agreement to market natural  
4 methane gas from an existing gob vent borehole from  
5 under a portion of State Game Land number 223 in  
6 Greene County, Southwest Region as shown on Exhibit  
7 OGM One on page 36. Alpha drilled the gob vent  
8 borehole for the purpose of venting gas to the  
9 atmosphere in order to protect underground mine  
10 workers. However, Alpha has the right to drill gob  
11 vent boreholes under mining regulations for the safety  
12 of miners.

13                   The only surface disturbance for the  
14 project will consist of the installation of  
15 approximately 1,100 feet of two-inch diameter gas line  
16 which will generally follow the existing access road.  
17 The agreement will be limited to the gob vent  
18 borehole. Alpha will pay the Commission a 12.5  
19 percent royalty of the wellhead price per MCF of gas  
20 produced and sold from the existing gob vent borehole.  
21 All royalty proceeds shall be deposited into the Game  
22 Fund.

23                   Development will be regulated by the  
24 Commonwealth's oil and gas regulations and the  
25 Commission's standard gas production agreement. The

1 agreement will include the Commission's standard  
2 wildlife and protection measures.

3 Alpha currently owns approximately 1,100  
4 acres of surface lands in Greene County which are  
5 enrolled in the hunter access programs.

6 MR. WEANER:

7 Motion to approve?

8 MR. SCHLEMMER:

9 Motion.

10 MR. WEANER:

11 Commissioner Schlemmer. Is there a  
12 second?

13 MR. SCHREFFLER:

14 Second.

15 MR. WEANER:

16 Commissioner Schreffler seconds the  
17 motion. Is there any discussion? Hearing none, we  
18 shall vote. All those in favor, signify by saying  
19 aye.

20 AYES RESPOND

21 MR. WEANER:

22 Those opposed, say no.

23 MR. PUTNAM:

24 Mr. President, the motion passes  
25 unanimously.



1 nine and a half years of my life. And I can remember  
2 going up to Penn State, being interviewed by the  
3 counsel, the Sportsmen's Advisory Counsel. I had  
4 never attended a Game Commission meeting prior to  
5 that. When I attended my first Commission meeting, I  
6 was kind of in awe. I said oh my God, what am I  
7 getting myself into. It was the feral cat and the  
8 orange issue. But I got through that one year. When  
9 I became the Commissioner, you know, I understood the  
10 three-legged issue of species management. I can tell  
11 you then and now that all my votes were entered with  
12 the science aspect only. I came in without an agenda.  
13 My votes were not tainted with an agenda. And I'm  
14 leaving without an agenda. The most important oath  
15 and obligation I took was when I was sworn in and I  
16 was told to defend the resource for all the citizens  
17 of Pennsylvania. I believe I did that.

18                   At the Pennsylvania Game Commission, deer  
19 isn't everything that we do here. We've had extended  
20 bear seasons, extended waterfowl seasons. We had  
21 pheasant reintroduction. Some areas are working.  
22 Some areas are not. We'll see what happens. We had  
23 hunter education training now done by computer, which  
24 I think is a big help because a lot of people just  
25 don't have the time like they used to years ago. We

1 had, over the eight years, thousands of acres that we  
2 have now only the State Game Land system. I can  
3 remember during the crossbow debate, the head of the  
4 Ohio DNR was at the podium. And he said that one of  
5 the things Ohio did not do which they should have done  
6 was what the Game Commission did, buy land for the  
7 hunters. And I never visited all these. Maybe I'll  
8 have some time in the next few years to go out and  
9 visit some of these properties that we've acquired for  
10 the hunters.

11                   Lastly, this is to our critics, there is  
12 no boogieman giving us secret signals and  
13 communications to vote for UN treaties. I have got to  
14 be honest with you. I said it before the last time.  
15 When the critics come up here and attack the Game  
16 Commission and make personal attacks, you're only  
17 hurting our sport because we are only about eight  
18 percent here in the Pennsylvania state, and we are  
19 dwindling because of attrition. Now, the baby boomers  
20 are going to start hitting that age where in five to  
21 ten years they may not be able to hunt anymore. So,  
22 when you're over there attacking our sport, the  
23 opposition sitting in the back hitting on a computer,  
24 sending out messages to people, asking them for money  
25 and attacking us. So, think about that when you're

1 attacking the Game Commission and our sport.

2           Other than that, I went through five  
3 cars. I do drive a lot with my business. I went  
4 through five cars. That was a trip. I had a personal  
5 incident. You know, my wife was sick, and it took  
6 about four and a half years of time while I was a  
7 Commissioner. And fortunately that worked out good.  
8 And I'm actually going to miss my colleagues. I'm  
9 going miss staff, Carl, staff, all the good times I  
10 had here intermittently. And one last thing, during  
11 the --- I used to have coffee gossip with a couple  
12 employees about the Sopranos. And they're not here.  
13 So, Linda Adams and Joan French, I used to go over  
14 there and talk to them about the Sopranos episode. We  
15 would talk about who got whacked and who was going to  
16 get whacked next. So, that was good Monday morning  
17 gossip. Other than that, it was a good eight-year  
18 run. I'm glad I did it. And thank you, everybody.

19           MR. WEANER:

20           Okay. Tom, I'll turn it over to you.

21           MR. BOOP:

22           Well, again, it's like being a country  
23 minister. I realize I'm preaching to the choir here  
24 and the audience today in the auditorium. I guess I  
25 may direct my remarks a little more generally to those

1 who might be watching these proceedings today. I'd  
2 like to think I'm a fairly private person, but I've  
3 had now little over --- well, six months to reflect  
4 upon this, serving out the six-month extension. Greg  
5 and I came on the same day. And our terms were  
6 officially --- the eight years were up in July, but  
7 because of the way the law is written, our successors  
8 weren't appointed. So, we've been able to continue to  
9 serve since that time.

10           The other thing that happened to me,  
11 since many of you know it anyway, but in April 29th  
12 --- or on April 29 of last year, I had a fairly  
13 serious heart surgery to correct an aortic valve  
14 problem that was a birth defect that I knew eventually  
15 was going to have to be taken care of. I just didn't  
16 think quite so soon. And when the surgeon tells you  
17 you have a seven chance of ten of surviving the  
18 surgery, it makes one a little bit reflective. But  
19 fortunately everything went well. I'm back to the gym  
20 and back to full activity with an excellent prognosis.  
21 But it does tend to concentrate one's thoughts a  
22 little bit.

23           It's sort of interesting. I grew up on a  
24 dairy farm in western Union County and have been a  
25 hunter since I was age 12. In fact, some of us did a

1 little bit of hunting before age 12 back in those days  
2 when you lived on a farm. But not many Pennsylvania  
3 sportsmen and women have an opportunity to be a  
4 Commissioner. It's an eight-year term. We have a  
5 million plus or minus over the years. And it's a  
6 great opportunity. It really is. And as Greg has  
7 noted, it's not without its problems. You get a lot  
8 of grief from a lot of people. And I think if I were  
9 telling people what's the number one criteria for  
10 being a Commissioner, it's you have to have a pretty  
11 tough skin because if you don't, you're not going to  
12 enjoy this very long. And I think Greg and I are both  
13 qualified in that regard. And I think most of the  
14 other people up here do as well.

15                   But as you reflect on it, I have a lot of  
16 different thoughts. I had a friend who recently died  
17 I had some conversations with. His comment was some  
18 of the best days of my life I spent hunting, fishing,  
19 being in the outdoors. As I reflect back on my own  
20 experiences, my grandfather died when I was a year  
21 old. So, I didn't really have a relationship with my  
22 paternal grandfather. My maternal grandfather lived  
23 out of state. So, I really didn't have much contact  
24 with him on a regular basis. But I would have never  
25 had been able to have the relationship with my uncles

1 and even my own father without the experience of  
2 hunting. It was a unique opportunity, particularly  
3 with my uncles, to spend a lot of time with them. In  
4 this day of fragmented families, a lot of those  
5 opportunities just don't exist. And when I had my own  
6 children, I had that opportunity. At this point, I do  
7 most of my hunting with six 30-year-old-somethings.  
8 And I'm the old guy now, but with my sons in  
9 particular, particularly my son-in-law, I wouldn't  
10 have the relationship that I have with them if we  
11 didn't spend eight or ten days hunting together. And  
12 those are experiences that you just can't get in many  
13 other ways.

14                   And we get a lot of comments over the  
15 years that there are poachers out there and there are  
16 other people that detract from our sport. And the  
17 popular media is very quick to lump all hunters with  
18 jack riders and other less desirable elements in our  
19 population. But if you pick up a copy of Ned Smith's  
20 Gone for the Day and you look through that, Ned made a  
21 few comments about that. And he said those kind of  
22 people don't last long in our sport. They are not  
23 going to stand out on a mountain in the rain for three  
24 hours and they're not going to put the effort and the  
25 time that it takes to become an outdoors person.

1                   And I go around the local counties and I  
2 select a lot of juries for trials. And when I select  
3 jurors, you have grand jury challenges that you can  
4 eliminate people for no reason at all off the panel.  
5 And if I know someone is a hunter, I'm very quick to  
6 respect that person as a juror because I think most of  
7 those people have the common sense, they've had the  
8 lifetime experiences. And I sort of have a joke among  
9 my staff and other lawyers that I will take any hunter  
10 or truck driver I can find. I don't want any  
11 passengers or nurses. It's just I've had bad  
12 experience in those regards. I don't think there's  
13 anybody out there that has better judgment. And I  
14 certainly don't mean that necessarily all hunters are  
15 truck drivers, but I've had very good experiences with  
16 truck drivers knowing what they know of the world  
17 because they're out there every day.

18                   So, the other thing that I would like to  
19 make is a point that sort of generally relates to that  
20 is that as parents, as mentors, as grandparents, we  
21 have an opportunity many times to have an impact on  
22 somebody else, whether that's our child, our nephew or  
23 the person we meet at the local rotary club or  
24 wherever. And we have an obligation as members of  
25 this community, the outdoor community, I believe, to

1 pass the experiences along to other people. When  
2 you're retired or sick or you're reflecting back on  
3 your life, no one's really going to care how many  
4 hours you worked. No one's going to care really about  
5 the promotions that you got. But if you can have a  
6 positive impact on somebody else's life, that's a very  
7 rewarding experience. And I can't think of a better  
8 forum to teach a young person, or not necessarily a  
9 young person, about ethics, about life. You have that  
10 situation where you have your child and you walk up to  
11 the first animal that they've taken. And there's some  
12 pretty conflicted emotions that occur in that  
13 situation. So, I think teaching people about the  
14 outdoors --- I'd like to think there are eight or  
15 nine people that hunt today that probably wouldn't be  
16 hunting if they hadn't had experiences with me over  
17 the years.

18                   But if we want this to continue, which I  
19 think we do, I think we all have an obligation to  
20 share with others what we've learned, experiences  
21 we've had. And you don't get into the personal issues  
22 so much with faith and community and all of those  
23 things, but you're out there in the spring on the side  
24 of the mountain turkey hunting, and the world starts  
25 to come alive at 5:30 in the morning, it's a little

1 hard to be an atheist for me. And I don't mean to be  
2 emotional about this, but it's just some of the things  
3 that I feel. And I think those are important  
4 situations.

5           And my sons are all Eagle scouts. And I  
6 think that they learned a lot through scouting. But  
7 they've also learned a lot through hunting as well and  
8 the outdoor community. So, if you have that chance  
9 --- and it's not Saturday afternoon at the range. I  
10 mean that doesn't do it. I think the studies show if  
11 you're going to successfully mentor someone, it takes  
12 a two to three-year period to do that because one year  
13 is not enough. You can expose them, but you're not  
14 going to hook them, so to speak, to use a pun, on that  
15 type of limited experience.

16           So, I think those things are important.  
17 I think those are obligations that we have as members  
18 of this outdoor community. We have a wonderful  
19 agency. I like the system that we have. We certainly  
20 have our disagreements, but --- you know, how does New  
21 York do it? How does Ohio do it? All those kinds of  
22 questions coming come up almost every meeting. On the  
23 long run, I would stack Pennsylvania up against  
24 anybody else in this agency, the way we do business  
25 here in Pennsylvania.

1                   You know I can't let the opportunity go  
2 by, but I made my farewell remarks in June, they're  
3 part of the record. I'm going to sort of stand on  
4 those. These are sort of ad lib comments today. But  
5 for the most part, I have been in agreement with our  
6 policy except I suppose my legacy and signature issue  
7 is going to be my longstanding criticism of the deer  
8 management program. You know, that started before I  
9 came. It's going on after I leave. And as I reflect  
10 on it, I don't like to think of myself as reactionary.  
11 We sit around at dinner at night and someone will  
12 proudly tell you they never shot an antlerless deer in  
13 their life. On last count, I shot close to 40 of  
14 them. So, I think I shocked my fellow Commissioners  
15 when I told them that I was going to probably demount  
16 one of my properties this next year. So, I don't  
17 think that I have a closed mind on the issue of what  
18 we need to do to manage deer.

19                   In looking back over the last eight  
20 years, I can't help but make the analogy to a  
21 government program. On a national basis, on a  
22 government program, we identify the problem and what  
23 do we do? We throw money at the problem thinking that  
24 the problem is going to go away. And a lot of times  
25 we just make the problem worse. And I think in many

1 respects that's what we've done with our deer  
2 management program. I mean we said --- and certainly  
3 I appreciate the fact that many areas of the state we  
4 have too many deer. We had too many deer in the late  
5 '90s when we embarked on this current program in 2000.  
6 But throwing tags at the problem hasn't really solved  
7 it. And I think it's probably made it worse. It's  
8 going to be up the rest of the people on this Board  
9 and the people that come behind to continue to address  
10 this problem. But I would like to think some of the  
11 votes that I lost, seven to one or six to two, that  
12 some of those ideas may come to fruition in the  
13 future.

14                   And I think we do have to manage  
15 different areas of the state differently. I think we  
16 have to manage private land differently than we manage  
17 public land. And you know, I know that's not going to  
18 be easy. And I know it's much more convenient just to  
19 have this sort of one size fits all. And all that's  
20 really done is ripping down the deer in the areas  
21 where people can hunt them. It's done very little to  
22 address the problem that they're too abundant, have  
23 been too abundant historically. So, I hope that we  
24 can take a serious look at public versus private forms  
25 of management. I hope we can take a serious look at

1 the size of some of these management units. And it's  
2 really not about the deer. We know how to bring the  
3 deer back. We could bring the herd back. It might  
4 take five years or more in some areas, but we know how  
5 to institute policies that bring them back. We know  
6 how to take a herd down. I mean it's a simple matter  
7 of having the concurrent season and gaining the  
8 access. We had the concurrent season but we haven't  
9 gained the access. And those are the things we have  
10 to do.

11                   My biggest fear, however, is not the  
12 deer. It's what happened to our hunters. I think all  
13 of the studies that you're going to read, if we lose a  
14 hunter for two years, we've lost that hunter. And  
15 I've been very disappointed, quite candidly, with some  
16 of the statewide agencies that support our hunters and  
17 those men and women out there. So, I think we all  
18 just need to do a better job. I think the problem is  
19 solvable, but it's not easy. If it were an easy  
20 problem, we would have already solved it. But we  
21 haven't. And I'm not sure we're any better off today  
22 than we were 11 years ago. In fact, I think you could  
23 make the argument that we're worse off on deer  
24 management today than we were. And I know there are  
25 people that would argue to the contrary.

1                   The final point that I would like to make  
2 sort of going back to my remarks before is whether  
3 you're a parent or grandparent or an aunt or an uncle  
4 or you're just --- you happen to know that young  
5 person down the street or across the block from where  
6 you live, get them to take hunter safety. I mean, I  
7 don't think there's a better course out there or  
8 better way to introduce people to what we're all  
9 about. Even if they don't want to go hunting, the  
10 familiarity with firearms, I've had not a lot but I  
11 probably over the course of my professional career,  
12 I've had four or five situations where the young  
13 person is over at the neighbor's house. And the child  
14 at that house gets out dad or grandpa's gun and shows  
15 them the gun and it accidentally discharges. And  
16 we've had a few really tragic situations under those  
17 circumstances, but get them to take hunter safety.  
18 And then try to get them a hunting license and get  
19 them out there. I did that with my daughter. My  
20 daughter hunted a couple years. And I don't want to  
21 direct this just to boys as opposed to girls because  
22 we have a lot of very capable women hunters out there.  
23 But someone who takes hunter safety, or if they hunt  
24 for a year or two, even if they don't continue with  
25 the sport, I think are much more likely to be

1 supportive of their children and grandchildren hunting  
2 than someone who's never been exposed to it.

3           So, it's been a great eight and a half  
4 years. And I have other things to do. So, I'm  
5 looking forward to doing some of those. And I'm  
6 probably not going to be back any time soon, but for  
7 the rest of these Commissioners up here, I have your  
8 e-mails or I know how to get your addresses to hound  
9 you a little bit with some of my thoughts on some of  
10 these issues. So, some of you are probably going to  
11 hear from me in the future. But it's been a great  
12 opportunity to serve. I've appreciated it. And I've  
13 met a lot of people that I consider friends and  
14 acquaintances that I wouldn't have otherwise had an  
15 opportunity to meet. I think that's somewhat ironic  
16 that Denny and Steve are leaving at the same time I  
17 am. They're the two regional directors that I've  
18 worked the most with. Denny for the whole time I've  
19 been a Commissioner and Steve for about half of that  
20 period. But they've done a good job, too, but none of  
21 us are irreplaceable. I'm sure there are good people  
22 to replace the two of you just as there are good  
23 people out there to replace me. So, it's been a fun  
24 ride, people, and I'll see you in the woods. Thanks.

25           MR. WEANER:

1                   Just speaking for the Board, I would say  
2 that both of you will be really missed a lot. It's  
3 going to be really odd to be here in April and not  
4 have you here joining us. I told some people last  
5 night I've been a school board member for 16 years,  
6 and we met twice a month. And I never got to know any  
7 of those people half as well as I know all these guys  
8 up here. I mean, we truly do have a lot of good times  
9 together and have made lifelong friendships. And we  
10 hope that you guys all keep in touch with us. We  
11 appreciate what you've done for the Commission.

12                   The next item on here is the election of  
13 officers. And before I start into this, I just wanted  
14 to say one or two things about my year as president.  
15 And I have thoroughly enjoyed the support of the rest  
16 of the Board for being president this year. And you  
17 know, I've met a lot of people that I wouldn't have  
18 met otherwise. And they say oh, wow, this is really  
19 important. You're the president of the Game  
20 Commission. Well, I'm a Commissioner. And the  
21 officers are really not that much more important than  
22 anyone else. We have an election every year so that  
23 we can run our meetings and be organized. But they've  
24 entrusted this authority in me this year. I've  
25 appreciated it. I've had a good working relationship

1 with the staff and with Carl and with everyone here.  
2 And I would just like to say thank you for the  
3 confidence that you had in me this year. And I look  
4 forward to some excitement to those that we elect to  
5 be officers for the next year.

6 Tom Boop and I are on the nominating  
7 committee. And our nominating committee report is as  
8 follows. For president, we have nominated Ralph  
9 Martone. For vice president, we have nominated Bob  
10 Schlemmer. And for secretary, we have nominated Dave  
11 Putnam. We will open nominations. We're going to do  
12 one officer at a time starting with president. And we  
13 will conduct our election here. So, at this point, I  
14 will open nominations for the office of president.  
15 Ralph Martone has been nominated already. Are there  
16 any further nominations? Hearing none, is there a  
17 motion to elect Ralph Martone as our president?

18 MR. BOOP:

19 So moved.

20 MR. WEANER:

21 Tom Boop moves. Is there a second?

22 MR. ISABELLA:

23 Second.

24 MR. WEANER:

25 Greg Isabella seconds. All those in

1 favor of electing Ralph Martone as president, signify  
2 by saying aye.

3 AYES RESPOND

4 MR. WEANER:

5 Those opposed, say no. Mr. Secretary?

6 MR. PUTNAM:

7 Mr. President, Ralph Martone is elected  
8 president unanimously.

9 MR. WEANER:

10 Congratulations.

11 MR. MARTONE:

12 Thank you.

13 MR. WEANER:

14 I'll finish this and then I'll turn it  
15 over to you.

16 MR. MARTONE:

17 I'm not so anxious.

18 MR. WEANER:

19 Bob Schlemmer has been nominated for vice  
20 president. Are there further nominations for vice  
21 president? Hearing none, is there a motion to elect  
22 Bob Schlemmer as vice president?

23 MR. PUTNAM:

24 So moved.

25 MR. DELANEY:

1 Second.

2 MR. WEANER:

3 Moved by Commissioner Putnam. And  
4 Commissioner Delaney seconds the motion. Any  
5 discussion on that? All those in favor of electing  
6 Bob Schlemmer as vice president, signify by saying  
7 aye.

8 AYES RESPOND

9 MR. WEANER:

10 Those opposed, say no.

11 MR. PUTNAM:

12 Mr. President, Commissioner Schlemmer is  
13 elected vice president unanimously.

14 MR. WEANER:

15 Thank you and congratulations. We now  
16 are to the office of secretary. Dave Putnam has been  
17 nominated. Are there further nominations? Hearing  
18 none, is there a motion to elect Dave Putnam as  
19 secretary?

20 MR. DELANEY:

21 So moved.

22 MR. WEANER:

23 Commissioner Delaney moves.

24 MR. ISABELLA:

25 Second.

1                   MR. WEANER:

2                   Second, Commissioner Isabella. Any  
3 discussion? All those in favor of electing Dave  
4 Putnam secretary, please say aye.

5 AYES RESPOND

6                   MR. WEANER:

7                   Those opposed, say no.

8                   MR. PUTNAM:

9                   Mr. President, Commissioner Putnam is  
10 elected secretary unanimously.

11                   MR. WEANER:

12                   Congratulations, Mr. Putnam.

13                   MR. PUTNAM:

14                   That was pretty easy.

15                   MR. WEANER:

16                   I will now turn the gavel over to ---.

17                   MR. MARTONE:

18                   Thank you.

19                   MR. WEANER:

20                   You can take my seat here.

21                   MR. MARTONE:

22                   You're a little too anxious I think.

23 Evidently he's taller than I am. I would particularly  
24 like to thank President Weaner for the year he has  
25 spent. Anyone that's heard me speak at meetings is

1 probably worried right now. And so I took time to  
2 write a few things down. So, if you don't mind, I'm  
3 going to read them. I would like to thank Ron Weaner,  
4 Jay Delaney and Greg Isabella for the excellent job  
5 they did as president of the Board since I joined as a  
6 Commissioner back in 2009. These men taught me a  
7 great deal about what it means to be an effective  
8 leader. I'm especially thankful to both Tom Boop and  
9 Greg Isabella for their hard work and leadership on  
10 behalf of the sportsmen and women of Pennsylvania. I  
11 cannot think of two men with more diverse  
12 personalities being willing and able to sit and  
13 rationally discuss issues and solve problems. They  
14 have set an example for all sportsmen across the state  
15 in working together for the common good.

16                   This year, like every year, the  
17 Pennsylvania Game Commission faces many challenges,  
18 including the ongoing challenge of balancing the  
19 scientific management of wildlife, the needs and  
20 desire of our licensed buyers and the concerns of the  
21 citizens of the Commonwealth. Several issues I hope  
22 to address as Board president in the coming year  
23 include a more proactive and comprehensive urban deer  
24 management program, a plan to promote and implement an  
25 adult mentor program and working with our law

1 enforcement officers in developing new and innovative  
2 methods of combat the growing problem of ATVs on State  
3 Game Lands.

4           As the Pennsylvania Game Commission  
5 prepares to seat a new class of recruits, the Board  
6 recognizes the training provided to our officers is  
7 the best in the nation. In the coming year, the Board  
8 hopes to work with Executive Director Roe, Deputy  
9 Director Hough and Bureau Chief Palmer to make certain  
10 our officers are the best equipped in the nation.

11           Also, in the coming year, I will ask the  
12 Board to work with me on simplifying the fluorescent  
13 orange regulations. With the Board's guidance, I  
14 would like to set up a Citizen's Advisory Group  
15 consisting of representatives from our conservation  
16 partners and members at large to study and make  
17 recommendations on changes to fluorescent orange  
18 requirements.

19           And last but not least, while I would  
20 like to give credit to Bob Frye and Jeff Mulholland  
21 for stimulating changes in the way the Board conducts  
22 business, I have to give credit where credit is due by  
23 acknowledging Commissioner Delaney. Jay has been  
24 promoting this idea for several years. And while I  
25 can't offer any details at this time, I can state that

1 the working group meeting prior to our April Board  
2 meeting and future meetings during the coming year  
3 will be open to the public. In closing, I would like  
4 to thank the Board for the confidence in me, and I  
5 promise to work hard in the coming year to justify  
6 that trust. Thank you. And at this time, the meeting  
7 is adjourned.

8 MR. SCHLEMMER:

9 Mr. President.

10 MR. MARTONE:

11 I'm sorry. I screwed up already.

12 MR. SCHLEMMER:

13 I'd just like to make one comment. I'd  
14 like to recognize some very special person here today,  
15 Barry Moore (phonetic). Barry's sitting in the back  
16 of the room. He was my second mentor. He's a retired  
17 Southeast regional director. And Barry, I would like  
18 to thank you for putting me on the right track, my  
19 friend. Okay.

20 MR. MOORE:

21 Thank you for putting me on the right  
22 track.

23 MR. MARTONE:

24 That had to be quite a task putting Bob  
25 on the right track.

1                   MR. BOOP:

2                   I would just like to make two quick  
3 comments. I'd like to personally and generally thank  
4 Commissioner Weaner. Being president of this  
5 organization, I can attest, is not one of the easiest  
6 jobs one can have. And Ron has certainly served  
7 diligently and with dignity this past year. He's had  
8 some health problems, too, which some of you are aware  
9 of. And he just has done a good job. And he passes  
10 it off a little too easily. But we were well served  
11 this past year, just as I'm sure we're going to be  
12 well served in the coming year by Ralph Martone being  
13 the president. And as someone who's going off the  
14 Board, I'd like to applaud Ralph and the Board. I  
15 think opening the working group meetings is the way to  
16 go. And I think that we all have a little trepidation  
17 maybe about how that's going to work out. But I think  
18 ultimately it's going to benefit all of us, including  
19 all those people and stakeholders who are interested  
20 in what we're about and how we do business. So, I'm  
21 looking forward to again --- after I throw the paper  
22 down and stomp on it, I still read your articles. So,  
23 I look forward to you reporting on what happens.

24                   MR. MARTONE:

25                   Commissioner Delaney.

1                   MR. DELANEY:

2                   Yeah. I would like to thank Commissioner  
3 Weaner for his guidance this last year. Ron is a very  
4 humble guy, but he really has allowed the  
5 Commissioners to offer their commentary. At times  
6 when there was some disagreement, he found a way to  
7 blend it out. So, I am thankful for his year of  
8 leadership. And I'm really excited with the new  
9 leadership that is in place for next year.

10                   And just to wrap up the final commentary  
11 that was mentioned last night by someone that  
12 Commissioner Isabella and Commissioner Boop really  
13 cancel each other out with their opinions, but I  
14 wholeheartedly disagree with that. I, as a  
15 Commissioner for the last several years, I think, have  
16 grown because of Commissioner Isabella and  
17 Commissioner Boop and what they both offered to me as  
18 a Commissioner. So they certainly don't cancel out.  
19 I think they offered a lot of really --- they had a  
20 huge impact on our sport. They're both very emotional  
21 in what they do. So, we have a tremendous loss as we  
22 lose Commissioner Isabella and Commissioner Boop. And  
23 I'm just thankful for their service to us and the  
24 sportsmen across the Commonwealth.

25                   MR. MARTONE:

1 Any other comments? Okay. Now I think I  
2 can adjourn the meeting. Thank you. This meeting is  
3 adjourned.

4 \* \* \* \* \*

5 HEARING CONCLUDED AT 10:26 A.M.

6 \* \* \* \* \*

7

8

9

10

CERTIFICATE

11

I hereby certify that the foregoing  
12 proceedings, meeting held before President Weaner, was  
13 reported by me on 01/24/2012 and that I Jolynn C.  
14 Prunoske read this transcript and that I attest that  
15 this transcript is a true and accurate record of the  
16 proceeding.

17

*Jolynn C. Prunoske*

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25